



**SEMINAR ORGANISED BY THE SUPREME COURT OF SPAIN IN COOPERATION WITH ACA-
EUROPE**

Madrid, 21 November 2022

***Questionnaire
Application of general principles and clauses in the case law of contentious-
administrative courts***

In order to deepen the open dialogue between the high administrative jurisdictions of Europe, this seminar will analyse the application, within the administrative legal system, of different general principles or clauses of law.

Given the variety and large number of existing general principles, an effort has first been made to delimit and select, on the basis of their topicality or potential expansion, a series of general principles which, although underlying most legal systems, nevertheless present differences in the various legal systems in terms of their nature, their recognition in legal norms and, in short, with regard to their functionality, with divergences evidenced in particular by their judicial application.

The seminar offers an eminently practical vision. For this reason, the questionnaire primarily takes judicial experience into consideration, suggesting the following perspectives as lines of analysis:

- (i) General principles of law in the system of sources;
- (ii) Common incorporation of general principles of law: European Union and horizontal dialogue;
- (iii) General principles and fundamental rights;
- (iv) General principles in certain sector-specific areas of public law, selecting, in this regard, some of these principles to determine their application and projection in fields such as *administrative organisation and procedure / administrative sanctions / public subsidies or grants / contracting by public bodies / town planning and environment / taxation*.

In short, the aim of the seminar is to find out whether there are convergences in the guidelines of the high jurisdictions of the Member States, by determining the degree of influence of European Union law (e.g. through Directive 2006/123/EC on services in the internal market, or through incorporation of the principle of good administration, recognised in Article 41 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights) in its application, without



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



losing sight of the effects of the horizontal dialogue between the high national jurisdictions, which we hope the seminar can continue to stimulate.

I. – GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LAW IN THE SYSTEM OF SOURCES

1º) What place and function do general principles of law have in the system of sources of your country's legal system?

- They are applied where there are gaps in the law
- They may be applied directly, even to the extent of displacing the initially applicable written law and prevailing over it.

Explain your answer briefly:

General principles of law are applied where there are gaps in the law. The most relevant principles in judicial practice have been incorporated into positive law through their recognition and inclusion in written laws, so they are often invoked directly through citation of the laws in which they are enshrined.

The most common application of general principles of law in decisions is the supplementary application of principles. This means that the reasoning of decisions states a specific applicable legal provision, and it also states a general principle of law that is applicable to a specific case. General principles of law can also be used independently in such a way that the reasoning of the decision is based solely on the application of a particular general principles of law. In such cases, there are certain gaps in the positive regulations that should regulate a certain legal situation.

2º) Can it be said that the most relevant general principles of law in your culture and legal tradition have been positivised, i.e. enshrined with legal status in your country's judicial system?

- Yes
- Yes, the most relevant ones (please indicate briefly the most notable of these)
- No

Yes

3º) In the judicial practice of Public Law, are general principles of law frequently invoked and applied as a basis for decisions?

- They are frequently invoked and applied, and are also relevant and decisive in the settlement of disputes.



Co-funded by
the European Union



- They are frequently invoked and applied, although generally in a complementary manner, to reinforce challenging arguments based primarily on the interpretation and application of written rules.
- They are not frequently invoked and applied as a basis for decisions.

Explain your answer briefly:

General principles of law are frequently invoked and applied, although generally in a complementary manner, to reinforce challenging arguments based primarily on the interpretation and application of written rules. The majority of the most relevant general principles of law are positivised, so the citation of such principles is usually done through direct invocation of the written rules in which they are contained.

4º) If you have answered yes to the previous question, can it be said that the invocation and application of general principles of law is done in a general and transverse way, in all areas or matters of Public Law?

- Yes
- Especially or particularly in certain matters, or in certain sector-specific areas (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

5º) In your country's legal system, are there general principles specific to Administrative Law, independent of other general principles of law?

- There are no general principles specific to Administrative Law
- There are principles specific to Administrative Law that may be applied in conjunction with other general principles
- There are principles specific to Administrative Law that exclude and displace the application of the other general principles

Explain your answer briefly:

There are no general principles specific to Administrative Law.

II. – COMMON INCORPORATION OF GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LAW: EUROPEAN UNION AND HORIZONTAL DIALOGUE



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



6º) Has your country's administrative legal system patently incorporated the general principles of European Union law?

- Yes, in general
- No special or specific incorporation has been necessary, because in general these principles were already recognised and enshrined in the country's legislation and practice.

Yes, in general

7º) Is it common in your country's judicial practice for the specific general principles of European Union law to be invoked and taken into account in areas where there is no regulatory harmonisation?

- Yes, for certain matters
- No, not generally

Yes, for certain matters

8º) When applying the general principles set out in European Union law, and when it is found that the general European principle applicable to the dispute in question conflicts in some way with national law, has the dispute been resolved through a solution involving the displacement and non-application of the national rule in order to give way to the general European principle?

- Yes
- This solution has been chosen in some cases, while in others different solutions or answers have been used (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

9º) Is it common in judicial practice for the principle of legitimate expectation to be invoked and taken into account?

- Yes, as a transversal principle
- Yes, but only in certain sector-specific matters and areas harmonised by Union law (please indicate what these are)
- No



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



The principle of legitimate expectation is applied to harmonised and non-harmonised areas.

10^o) Can taking the principle of legitimate expectation into account even result in the annulment of administrative decisions that are contrary to or violate those principles?

- Yes
- No, these principles are applied only in order to provide for compensation or reparation when they are violated in some way by the decisions of the Administration.

Explain your answer briefly.

Yes

One example is the case of the admissibility of a regular audit given the amount of the subject matter of the dispute. Regarding the constitutional complaints of the parties whose motion for revisions were rejected due to insufficient amount of the subject of the dispute, and this amount was sufficient to file a motion for revision at the time of filing the action, the Constitutional Court concluded that there was a violation of the right of legitimate expectations.

11^o) Has the “principle of good administration” referred to in Article 41 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union been adopted and applied in your country’s judicial practice?

- Yes, as a transversal principle
- Yes, but only in certain sector-specific matters and areas harmonised by Union law (please indicate what these are)
- Not commonly applied

Explain your answer briefly.

Yes, as a transversal principle.

This principle is invoked and applied transversally because although it is not included under this name in our judicial practice, it is implicit in other general constitutional principles such as objectivity, efficiency, impartiality and effectiveness.

12^o) Can taking the principle of good administration into account even result in the annulment of administrative decisions that are contrary to or violate that principle?

- Yes, in some specific cases.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



- This would never be possible because, among other reasons, this principle applies solely as a guideline for conduct within the Administration and cannot be invoked by the citizen.
- No

Yes, in some specific cases

13^o) Is it common in judicial practice for the principle of necessity and proportionality of administrative measures that limit or restrict access to or the exercise of an economic activity to be invoked and taken into account?

- Yes, this is a positivised principle whose non-observance results in the nullity of the measure or provision of a general nature.
- Yes, in certain matters and to different extents
- No

Yes, in certain matters and to different extents.

14^o) With regard to any of the above principles (legitimate expectation, necessity, proportionality or good administration) or other principles, has your country's Supreme Court taken into consideration the interpretation and manner of application of these principles by other European national high jurisdictions?

- Yes, on some occasions (in this case, explain your answer briefly)
- Never

No

III. – GENERAL PRINCIPLES AND FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

15^o) According to Article 6, paragraph 3 of the Treaty on European Union, fundamental rights that result from the constitutional traditions common to the Member States shall constitute general principles of the Union's law. Has your country's Supreme Court identified any of these common constitutional traditions?

- Yes, especially on the basis of the case law of the Court of Justice or the European Court of Human Rights
- Yes, especially on the basis of the case law of the Supreme Courts of other Member States.
- No such identification has taken place.



Co-funded by
the European Union



Yes, especially on the basis of the case law of the Court of Justice or the European Court of Human Rights

16^o) What status and importance does the principle of non-discrimination and gender equality have in your country's judicial practice?

- It is a principle commonly and generally taken into consideration, across all areas
- It is a principle that is taken into consideration and applied in certain legal relations and sector-specific areas

The principle of non-discrimination and gender equality has multiple applications and is generally applied transversally in different areas of action by the public authorities.

17^o) In the judicial practice of your country, is the principle of protection of particularly vulnerable groups (e.g. minors, women, people with disabilities) invoked and applied?

- Yes, in a general, open and transversal manner
- Yes, for certain groups that are predetermined and identified in the different sector-specific rules (give a significant example)
- No

Yes, in a general, open and transversal manner but there is no list of particularly vulnerable groups as such.

18^o) Do the judicial bodies demand enhanced reasoning in cases where the contested administrative measure or decision (e.g. eviction from housing, granting of nationality) affects these vulnerable groups (e.g. minors, women, people with disabilities) or has an impact on other constitutional values such as protection of the family?

- No special grounds are required in these cases
- Yes, and their absence results in the nullity of the decision

No special grounds are required in these cases

19^o) In your judicial practice, have disputes been raised regarding the issue of the principles of transparency, equality and non-discrimination in relation to decisions based on artificial intelligence or predictive data management systems?



Co-funded by
the European Union



- Yes
- These principles are not frequently invoked, but some examples exist
- No

Explain your answer briefly.

N/a.

IV. – GENERAL PRINCIPLES IN CERTAIN SECTOR-SPECIFIC AREAS OF PUBLIC LAW

IV.1. – ORGANISATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE

20^a) In the administrative organisation, do the principles of decentralisation and subsidiarity apply?

- Yes
- No
- Not generally, but in certain areas or sectors (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

21^a) Are the general principles set out below applicable to the procedure for formulating administrative acts and provisions?

Principle of publicity and transparency

- Yes
- No

Yes

Principle of proportionality

- Yes
- No

Yes

Principle of impartiality





- Yes
- No

Yes

Principle of anti-formalism

- Yes
- No

Yes

Principle of gratuitousness

- Yes
- No

Yes

Principle of self-correction (executory decision, without the need for judicial assistance).

- Yes
- No

Yes

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of administrative procedure different from the above)

IV.2. – ADMINISTRATIVE SANCTIONS

22^o) Are the general principles of criminal law applied or projected in the area of administrative sanctions law? (Indicate the answer that you consider best reflects your legislation and practice)

- Yes
- Yes, although with nuances arising from the different natures of criminal offences and administrative offences
- Not in respect of minor, lesser or trivial infractions
- Only in relation to infractions that can be characterised as “criminal” in accordance with the doctrine of the ECHR

Explain your answer briefly.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Yes, although with nuances arising from the different natures of criminal offences and administrative offences. Principles of criminal law are applicable, with certain nuances, to administrative sanctions law, since they are both manifestations of the state's penal system.

23^o) If you have answered yes to the previous question, could you specify whether or not the following general principles are applied for administrative sanctions, or to what extent?

Principle of presumption of innocence and right not to incriminate oneself or plead guilty:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principles of legality and definition of the constituent elements of the offence:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of non-retroactivity of sanctioning provisions:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of culpability:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Principle of proportionality

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of defence and legal assistance:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of hearing:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of separation between investigating authority and decision-making authority

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of reasoning of the sanctioning decision

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes





Principle of time-barring of administrative offences and sanctions

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of judicial protection

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of double instance

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of administrative sanctions law different from the above)

IV.3. – SUBSIDIES AND PUBLIC AID

24^o) Is the principle of proportionality applied in order to modulate the consequences of non-compliance by a beneficiary of public subsidies, aid or resources, or in the area of regulated sectors?

- Yes (in this case, explain briefly in what areas and with what consequences or effects)
- No



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



The principle of proportionality is used in these cases to modulate the consequences of non-compliance, tempering the negative effects according to, for example the degree of partial compliance identified.

IV.4. – CONTRACTING BY PUBLIC BODIES

25º) Is contracting by public bodies governed by different principles from contracting between private individuals and entities?

- Yes. Although based on a common foundation, administrative contracting is governed by different principles from civil or private contracting.
- There are specific principles applicable to contracting by public bodies as regards the procedure for advertising and selecting contractors and the award of the contract, but the performance, execution and effects of the contract are governed by principles substantially the same as those applicable to private contracting.
- No, public and private contracting are essentially governed by the same rules and principles.

Yes. Although based on a common foundation, administrative contracting is governed by different principles from civil or private contracting.

IV.5. – TOWN PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT

26º) Could you say whether the following principles of environmental law are invoked and applied in your judicial practice?

Precautionary principle

- Yes
- No
- Occasionally, or on a limited basis (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

“Polluter pays” principle

- Yes
- No
- Occasionally, or on a limited basis (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



IV.6. – TAXATION

27º) In tax matters, are the following principles applied in your legislation and judicial practice?

Principle of legality: Tax liability can be established only by rules with legal status.

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of economic or contributory capacity

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principles of equality and generality

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

Principle of progressiveness and its limit: non-confiscatory taxation

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Yes

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of tax law different from the above)





-0-0-0-0-0-0-



**Co-funded by
the European Union**