



**SEMINAR ORGANISED BY THE SUPREME COURT OF SPAIN IN COOPERATION WITH ACA-
EUROPE**

Madrid, 21 November 2022

***Questionnaire
Application of general principles and clauses in the case law of contentious-
administrative courts***

In order to deepen the open dialogue between the high administrative jurisdictions of Europe, this seminar will analyse the application, within the administrative legal system, of different general principles or clauses of law.

Given the variety and large number of existing general principles, an effort has first been made to delimit and select, on the basis of their topicality or potential expansion, a series of general principles which, although underlying most legal systems, nevertheless present differences in the various legal systems in terms of their nature, their recognition in legal norms and, in short, with regard to their functionality, with divergences evidenced in particular by their judicial application.

The seminar offers an eminently practical vision. For this reason, the questionnaire primarily takes judicial experience into consideration, suggesting the following perspectives as lines of analysis:

- (i) General principles of law in the system of sources;
- (ii) Common incorporation of general principles of law: European Union and horizontal dialogue;
- (iii) General principles and fundamental rights;
- (iv) General principles in certain sector-specific areas of public law, selecting, in this regard, some of these principles to determine their application and projection in fields such as *administrative organisation and procedure / administrative sanctions / public subsidies or grants / contracting by public bodies / town planning and environment / taxation*.

In short, the aim of the seminar is to find out whether there are convergences in the guidelines of the high jurisdictions of the Member States, by determining the degree of influence of European Union law (e.g. through Directive 2006/123/EC on services in the internal market, or through incorporation of the principle of good administration, recognised in Article 41 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights) in its application, without



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



losing sight of the effects of the horizontal dialogue between the high national jurisdictions, which we hope the seminar can continue to stimulate.

I. – GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LAW IN THE SYSTEM OF SOURCES

1^o) What place and function do general principles of law have in the system of sources of your country's legal system?

- X They are applied where there are gaps in the law
- o They may be applied directly, even to the extent of displacing the initially applicable written law and prevailing over it.

Explain your answer briefly: The Polish legal system is a part of the civil law system. The judges are subordinated to the constitution and statutes (Article 178 § 1 of the Polish Constitution). Article 8 of the Polish Constitution states that the Constitution shall be the supreme law of the Republic of Poland and that the provisions of the Constitution shall apply directly, unless the Constitution provides otherwise. The rule is that the provisions of the Constitution are applied directly. This means that the Court, when applying the laws in a given case, may also base its decision on the rules contained in the Constitution. However, not every constitutional norm can be applied directly. Although the general principles of law are significant for the jurisprudence of administrative courts, their adoption cannot displace the written law prevailing over it. The general principles can indicate the way in which the written law should be understood. They cannot substitute this regulation. In the practice of Polish administrative law, the general law principles are evoked frequently both for strengthening the court's reasoning and for selecting the final outcome. Those principles are treated as normative (not only descriptive) and are being developed in an application of selected statutory and under statutory regulations.

2^o) Can it be said that the most relevant general principles of law in your culture and legal tradition have been positivised, i.e. enshrined with legal status in your country's judicial system?

- X Yes
- o Yes, the most relevant ones (please indicate briefly the most notable of these)
- o No

3^o) In the judicial practice of Public Law, are general principles of law frequently invoked and applied as a basis for decisions?



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



- They are frequently invoked and applied, and are also relevant and decisive in the settlement of disputes.
- They are frequently invoked and applied, although generally in a complementary manner, to reinforce challenging arguments based primarily on the interpretation and application of written rules.
- They are not frequently invoked and applied as a basis for decisions.

Explain your answer briefly: The general principles reinforce reasons based on the interpretation of written rules. As it was mentioned (explanation to question 1), if there are two or more possible results of legal interpretation, an adoption of general principles is feasible to choose one of them. The administrative courts do not avoid resorting to the general principles of law, which are crucial for an assessment of legality acts issued by the public administration (like the principles of lawfulness, the principle of proportionality, the principle of the separation of powers).

4^o) If you have answered yes to the previous question, can it be said that the invocation and application of general principles of law is done in a general and transverse way, in all areas or matters of Public Law?

- Yes
- Especially or particularly in certain matters, or in certain sector-specific areas (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

5^o) In your country's legal system, are there general principles specific to Administrative Law, independent of other general principles of law?

- There are no general principles specific to Administrative Law
- There are principles specific to Administrative Law that may be applied in conjunction with other general principles
- There are principles specific to Administrative Law that exclude and displace the application of the other general principles

Explain your answer briefly: In Poland, there is no statute of general principles of administrative law. To some extent, this role is performed by the principles of administrative proceedings (like the principle of lawfulness, the principle of material truth, the principle of inspiring trust in public administration). They are specific due to the activity of public administration and applied in conjunction with other general principles, derived mainly from the constitution (like the principle of proportionality).

It is worth mentioning, that for some specific areas of administrative law detailed principles are evoked. Separate scope of general principles (partially similar to the general ones) is present in the tax ordinance. Specific principles are binding for the administrative enforcement proceedings (e.g. the principle of expediency according to





which the enforcement measures are being applied only for achieving the aim of the enforcement proceeding).

II. – COMMON INCORPORATION OF GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF LAW: EUROPEAN UNION AND HORIZONTAL DIALOGUE

6^o) Has your country's administrative legal system patently incorporated the general principles of European Union law?

- Yes, in general
- No special or specific incorporation has been necessary, because in general these principles were already recognised and enshrined in the country's legislation and practice.

Explain your answer briefly (this question mainly concerns the work of the legislator, i.e. the “legislative system”). Before its accession to the EU Poland was obliged to adopt European order (acquis communautaire) to its own legal system. This process was not combined with the general principles of administrative law, but with specific legal regulations. The principles were present in the Polish legal order in the Constitution, the statutory law and in the legal interpretation of administrative courts.

7^o) Is it common in your country's judicial practice for the specific general principles of European Union law to be invoked and taken into account in areas where there is no regulatory harmonisation?

- Yes, for certain matters
- No, not generally

Explain your answer briefly (this question mainly concerns the work of the judiciary, i.e. “judicial practice”). The general principles of EU law are the component of Polish law and for that reason, they take part in the legal interpretation performed by administrative courts. Such principles as the right to good administration (Article 41 EU Charter) are adopted in all areas of administrative law, independently from their connection to the EU law.

8^o) When applying the general principles set out in European Union law, and when it is found that the general European principle applicable to the dispute in question conflicts in some way with national law, has the dispute been resolved through a solution involving the displacement and non-application of the national rule in order to give way to the general European principle?



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



X Yes

- This solution has been chosen in some cases, while in others different solutions or answers have been used (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

9^o) Is it common in judicial practice for the principle of legitimate expectation to be invoked and taken into account?

- Yes, as a transversal principle
- Yes, but only in certain sector-specific matters and areas harmonised by Union law (please indicate what these are)
- No

Explain your answer briefly. The principle of legitimate expectations since 2017 (the amendment of the Polish Code of Administrative Procedure) is a part of the Polish statutory legal order (see article 8 § 2 of the Polish Code of Administrative Proceedings). It is invoked by administrative courts in written explanations of judgments in those disputes for which courts assess it as necessary. In other words, a breach of this principle is connected with a violation of more specific regulations that in another dispute were differently assessed.

10^o) Can taking the principle of legitimate expectation into account even result in the annulment of administrative decisions that are contrary to or violate those principles?

X Yes

- No, these principles are applied only in order to provide for compensation or reparation when they are violated in some way by the decisions of the Administration.

Explain your answer briefly. Yes, in certain disputes it could be possible. In practice, it would be usually combined with more specific violations of administrative law. A violation of this principle is usually combined with more specific regulations that have been differently interpreted in another dispute.

11^o) Has the “principle of good administration” referred to in Article 41 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union been adopted and applied in your country’s judicial practice?

- Yes, as a transversal principle
- Yes, but only in certain sector-specific matters and areas harmonised by Union law (please indicate what these are)
- Not commonly applied



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Explain your answer briefly. Pursuant to Art. 6 sec. 1 TEU The Charter has the legal force equal to the Treaties, and its Art. 41 is directly effective. The principle of good administration finds a broad application in the Polish judicial practice as one of the general principles for all specific branches of administrative law.

12^o) Can taking the principle of good administration into account even result in the annulment of administrative decisions that are contrary to or violate that principle?

- Yes, in some specific cases.
- This would never be possible because, among other reasons, this principle applies solely as a guideline for conduct within the Administration and cannot be invoked by the citizen.
- No

Explain your answer briefly. The violation of this principle is usually connected with a violation of more specific legal rules. As it was mentioned before, the Polish administrative courts give significant attention to this principle.

13^o) Is it common in judicial practice for the principle of necessity and proportionality of administrative measures that limit or restrict access to or the exercise of an economic activity to be invoked and taken into account?

- Yes, this is a positivised principle whose non-observance results in the nullity of the measure or provision of a general nature.
- Yes, in certain matters and to different extents
- No

Explain your answer briefly. The mentioned principle is derived from the constitutional and statutory (administrative proceedings) sources. It is analysed in the jurisprudence of administrative courts on a basis of concrete legal and factual circumstances.

14^o) With regard to any of the above principles (legitimate expectation, necessity, proportionality or good administration) or other principles, has your country's Supreme Court taken into consideration the interpretation and manner of application of these principles by other European national high jurisdictions?

- Yes, on some occasions (in this case, explain your answer briefly)





X Never



III. – GENERAL PRINCIPLES AND FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

15^o) According to Article 6, paragraph 3 of the Treaty on European Union, fundamental rights that result from the constitutional traditions common to the Member States shall constitute general principles of the Union's law. Has your country's Supreme Court identified any of these common constitutional traditions?

- Yes, especially on the basis of the case law of the Court of Justice or the European Court of Human Rights
- Yes, especially on the basis of the case law of the Supreme Courts of other Member States.
- No such identification has taken place.

16^o) What status and importance does the principle of non-discrimination and gender equality have in your country's judicial practice?

- It is a principle commonly and generally taken into consideration, across all areas
- It is a principle that is taken into consideration and applied in certain legal relations and sector-specific areas

Explain your answer briefly. This principle is specific to particular branches of administrative law (e.g. refugee law), but there are no obstacles in the Polish law to adopt it in any dispute for which it will be necessary.

17^o) In the judicial practice of your country, is the principle of protection of particularly vulnerable groups (e.g. minors, women, people with disabilities) invoked and applied?

- Yes, in a general, open and transversal manner
- Yes, for certain groups that are predetermined and identified in the different sector-specific rules (give a significant example)
- No

Explain your answer briefly. There are no obstacles to the application of this principle if it will be necessary in concrete legal and factual circumstances.

18^o) Do the judicial bodies demand enhanced reasoning in cases where the contested administrative measure or decision (e.g. eviction from housing, granting of nationality) affects these vulnerable groups (e.g. minors, women, people with



Co-funded by
the European Union



disabilities) or has an impact on other constitutional values such as protection of the family?

- No special grounds are required in these cases
- Yes, and their absence results in the nullity of the decision

Explain your answer briefly. For those disputes the general rules of reasoning are binding. The constitutional rules (like the mentioned protection of family or protection of human dignity) are applicable. It is worth pointing out, however, that the breach of the principles of equal treatment is one of the conditions for the resumption of administrative proceedings.

19^o) In your judicial practice, have disputes been raised regarding the issue of the principles of transparency, equality and non-discrimination in relation to decisions based on artificial intelligence or predictive data management systems?

- Yes
- These principles are not frequently invoked, but some examples exist
- No

Explain your answer briefly. The principles of transparency, equality and non-discrimination are applied by the Polish administrative courts but rather with a weak connection with decisions based on artificial intelligence and predictive data management systems. There are almost no decisions issued by those systems.

IV. – GENERAL PRINCIPLES IN CERTAIN SECTOR-SPECIFIC AREAS OF PUBLIC LAW

IV.1. – ORGANISATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURE

20^o) In the administrative organisation, do the principles of decentralisation and subsidiarity apply?

- Yes
- No
- Not generally, but in certain areas or sectors (in this case, explain your answer briefly)



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



21º) Are the general principles set out below applicable to the procedure for formulating administrative acts and provisions?

Principle of publicity and transparency

- Yes
- No

Principle of proportionality

- Yes
- No

Principle of impartiality

- Yes
- No

Principle of anti-formalism

- Yes
- No

Principle of gratuitousness

- Yes
- No

Principle of self-correction (executory decision, without the need for judicial assistance).

- Yes
- No

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of administrative procedure different from the above)

It is worth mentioning to take into consideration the principle of amicable settlement of disputes and the principle of persuasion. Both of them have crucial importance for voluntary performance of administrative obligations.

IV.2. – ADMINISTRATIVE SANCTIONS



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



22^o) Are the general principles of criminal law applied or projected in the area of administrative sanctions law? (Indicate the answer that you consider best reflects your legislation and practice)

- Yes
- Yes, although with nuances arising from the different natures of criminal offences and administrative offences
- Not in respect of minor, lesser or trivial infractions
- Only in relation to infractions that can be characterised as “criminal” in accordance with the doctrine of the ECHR

Explain your answer briefly. In the Polish code of administrative procedure separate to the criminal law principles for the area of administrative sanctions are distinguished. However, their content is partially similar to the criminal law. In other words, administrative authorities in a process of sanctioning apply the rules from the code of administrative proceedings.

23^o) If you have answered yes to the previous question, could you specify whether or not the following general principles are applied for administrative sanctions, or to what extent?

Principle of presumption of innocence and right not to incriminate oneself or plead guilty:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principles of legality and definition of the constituent elements of the offence:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of non-retroactivity of sanctioning provisions:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of culpability:

- Yes
- No



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of proportionality

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of defence and legal assistance:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of hearing:

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of separation between investigating authority and decision-making authority

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly) Administrative proceeding and final decision is being issued by the same administrative authority. If a decision is final, it can be a subject of a judicial control.

Principle of reasoning of the sanctioning decision

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of time-barring of administrative offences and sanctions

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of judicial protection

- Yes
- No





- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of double instance

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of administrative sanctions law different from the above)

IV.3. – SUBSIDIES AND PUBLIC AID

24^o) Is the principle of proportionality applied in order to modulate the consequences of non-compliance by a beneficiary of public subsidies, aid or resources, or in the area of regulated sectors?

- Yes (in this case, explain briefly in what areas and with what consequences or effects)
- No

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of subsidies or public aid different from the above)

IV.4. – CONTRACTING BY PUBLIC BODIES

25^o) Is contracting by public bodies governed by different principles from contracting between private individuals and entities?

- Yes. Although based on a common foundation, administrative contracting is governed by different principles from civil or private contracting.
- There are specific principles applicable to contracting by public bodies as regards the procedure for advertising and selecting contractors and the award of the contract, but the performance, execution and effects of the contract are governed by principles substantially the same as those applicable to private contracting.
- No, public and private contracting are essentially governed by the same rules and principles.

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of contracting by public bodies different from the above)



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



IV.5. – TOWN PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENT

26^o) Could you say whether the following principles of environmental law are invoked and applied in your judicial practice?

Precautionary principle

- Yes
- No
- Occasionally, or on a limited basis (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

“Polluter pays” principle

- Yes
- No
- Occasionally, or on a limited basis (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general town planning or environmental principles different from the above)

IV.6. – TAXATION

27^o) In tax matters, are the following principles applied in your legislation and judicial practice?

Principle of legality: Tax liability can be established only by rules with legal status.

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of economic or contributory capacity

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principles of equality and generality

- Yes
- No



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

Principle of progressiveness and its limit: non-confiscatory taxation

- Yes
- No
- With nuances (in this case, explain your answer briefly)

(If you consider it appropriate, please indicate any other general principles of tax law different from the above)

-0-0-0-0-0-0-



**Co-funded by
the European Union**